IEEE 200X Fast Track Change Proposal

ID: FT10

Proposed By: Jim Lewis  jim@synthworks.com
Analyzed By: Jim Lewis  jim@synthworks.com
With significant input from John Ries

Status: Analyzed
Proposed: 12/03
Analyzed: 05/04

Enhancement Summary:
Add Ternary Operators
Make conditional signal assignment work for sequential signal and variable assignments.
Make selected signal assignment work in sequential signal and variable assignments

Revisions:
Rev1: Initial release
Removed proposed changes to conditional waveforms due to ambiguity.
Combined conditional assignments with selected assignments.

Related issues:

Relevant LRM sections:
7.1, 8.4, 8.4.1, 8.5, 9.5, 9.5.1, 9.5.2

Enhancement Detail:
The initial target of this enhancement is to simplify code of the form:

```vhdl
if (FP = '1') then
  NextState <= FLASH ;
else
  NextState <= IDLE ;
end if ;
```

By allowing conditional signal assignments in a process, the above code can be rewritten as:

```vhdl
NextState <= FLASH when (FP = '1') else IDLE ;
```

Others have requested a capability to do something similar in initializations and other contexts as shown below. To accomplish this, we need introduce a ternary expression.

```vhdl
Signal A : integer := 7 when GEN_VAL = 1 else 15 ;
```

Ternary expression applied to constraining size of an array:

```vhdl
entity fifo is
  generic (word_size : Natural := 8);
```
We also need to maintain backward compatibility. This means the following must retain their current interpretation:

The following two must be equivalent (backward compatibility):

\[ \text{EX}_1\text{A}: \ Y \leq A \text{ and } B \text{ when } S = '1' \text{ else } C \text{ and } D; \]
\[ \text{EX}_1\text{B}: \ Y \leq (A \text{ and } B) \text{ when } S = '1' \text{ else } (C \text{ and } D); \]

Other interpretations are possible by using a ternary expression.

\[ \text{EX}_1\text{C}: \ Y \leq A \text{ and } (B \text{ when } S = '1' \text{ else } C) \text{ and } D; \]

The following two must be equivalent (backward compatibility):

\[ \text{EX}_2\text{A}: \ Y \leq '1' \text{ when } \text{en}'=1' \text{ else } 'Z' \text{ after } 5 \text{ ns}; \]
\[ \text{EX}_2\text{B}: \ Y \leq '1' \text{ after } 0 \text{ ns when } \text{en}'=1' \text{ else } 'Z' \text{ after } 5 \text{ ns}; \]

Other interpretations are possible by using a ternary expression.

\[ \text{EX}_2\text{C}: \ Y \leq ('1' \text{ when } \text{en} = '1' \text{ else } 'Z') \text{ after } 5 \text{ ns}; \]

The following is a test case to make sure that the grammar for ternary expressions and conditional waveforms are not ambiguous.

\[ \text{EX}_3: \ Y \leq (A \text{ when } S1='1' \text{ else } B) \text{ when } S2='1' \text{ else } C; \]

\[ \text{ternary expression} \quad \text{conditional waveform} \]

Being able to support both ternary expressions and conditional signal assignment in the same code gives us the following simplified code for a synchronous reset register:

\[ \text{AReg} \leq ('0' \text{ when } \text{nReset} = '1' \text{ else } A) \text{ when rising_edge(Clk)}; \]

With only conditional signal assignment, this would need to be written as:

\[ \text{AReg} \leq
\begin{align*}
  & '0' \text{ when } \text{nReset} = '1' \text{ and rising_edge(Clk)} \text{ else} \\
  & A \text{ when rising_edge(Clk)};
\end{align*} \]

Without the extra clock condition, reset takes precedence and the reset becomes asynchronous reset (currently supported by IEEE-1076-2002):

\[ \text{AReg} \leq '0' \text{ when } \text{nReset} = '1' \text{ else } A \text{ when rising_edge(Clk)}; \]
Approach Overview:
In section 7 added ternary expression. To keep the relationship between EX_1A and EX_1B correct, ternary expressions will need to have lower precedence than logical operators. Nesting of ternary expressions occurs through a primary having a choice of “(expression)”.

Add section 7.6 that defines ternary expressions and how they are evaluated. Note that ternary expressions are not operators and hence are not overloaded. Their result value is a function of the result value of the enclosed expressions.

In section 8, redefine sequential signal assignments to allow for simple signal assignment, conditional signal assignment, and selected signal assignment. Much of the current section 8.4 will be moved to 8.4.1 simple signal assignment. This section is needed since other signal assignments are transformed to a simple signal assignment. Move the current 8.4.1 to 8.4.1.1. Add section 8.4.2 conditional signal assignment. Much of the text will come from the current section on conditional signal assignments. Changes were made to the BNF to distinguish it from simple signal assignment. Add section 8.4.3 selected signal assignment.

Move syntax for guarded to 8.4.1, but also note that it is an error to use it in the sequential form of signal assignments.

Redefine variable assignments to allow for simple variable assignment and selected variable assignment. Conditional variable assignment can be handled by ternary expressions (see further study). Define transformations as done for signals.

In section 9, redefine concurrent signal assignments to allow for simple signal assignment, conditional signal assignment, and selected signal assignment. Text will describe the transformation from concurrent signal assignment to the equivalent process, but will no longer need transformations for conditional and selected signal assignments as they are covered in 8.4.

Further Study
The following are items for further study.

1. Is it ok to make unaffected a primary that is only legal for signal and variable assignments and to expand ternary expression to:

   ternary_expression ::= logical {when condition else logical} [when condition]

2. Do we want to change the name signal_assignment_statement to sequential_signal_assignment_statement (to distinguish it from concurrent_signal_assignment_statement). It would make some of the text easier to read.
LRM Changes

Changes to Clause 7.1
Modify the BNF in section 7.1 as follows:

```plaintext
expression ::= ternary_expression

ternary_expression ::= logical { when condition else logical }

logical ::= relation { and relation }
| relation { or relation }
| relation { xor relation }
| relation [ nand relation ]
| relation [ nor relation ]
| relation { xnor relation }
```

Add new Clause 7.6
7.6 Ternary Expression
A ternary expression is an expression that selects a result value from one of the enclosed expressions. To select a result value, the conditions are evaluated in succession until one evaluates to TRUE. The expression preceding the TRUE condition is evaluated and its result value is the result value of the ternary expression. If all of the conditions evaluate to FALSE the last expression is evaluated and its value is the result value of the ternary expression.

Note: A ternary expression is not an operator or subprogram and it cannot be overloaded.

Examples:
Use of a ternary expression to initialize a signal:
```plaintext
Signal A : integer := 7 when GEN_VAL = 1 else 15 ;
```

Use of a ternary expression to constrain the size of an array:
```plaintext
entity fifo is
generic (word_size : Natural := 8);
port ( data : std_logic_vector( 
(7 when word_size <= 8 else
15 when word_size <= 16 else 31) downto 0) ;

-- Added parentheses to demonstrate evaluation order:
port ( data : std_logic_vector( 
(7 when word_size <= 8 else
(15 when word_size <= 16 else 31)) downto 0);
```

Ternary expressions allow a richer set of expressions than currently available in conditional signal assignment:
```plaintext
Y <= A and (B when S = '1' else C) and D ;
Y <= ('1' when en = '1' else 'Z') after 5 ns ;
```
Note:
In the context of signal assignment, when an expression is in parentheses and it contains a condition, it is a ternary expression.

Editing note for 7.6
If ternary expressions are expanded as suggested in Further Study, the following text replaces the last sentence of the first paragraph in clause 7.6

If all of the conditions evaluate to FALSE and there is an expression following the last condition, this expression is evaluated and its result value is the result value of the ternary expression. If all of the conditions evaluate to FALSE and there is not an expression following the last condition, then the result value of the ternary expression is unaffected.

Change Clause 8.4 to:
8.4 Signal assignment statement
A signal assignment statement modifies the projected output waveforms contained in the drivers of one or more signals (see 12.6.1).

signal_assignment_statement ::= [label :] simple_signal_assignment | [label :] conditional_signal_assignment | [label :] selected_signal_assignment

8.4 Simple signal assignment

simple_signal_assignment ::= target <= options waveform ;

options ::= [guarded][delay_mechanism]

delay_mechanism ::= transport | [ reject time_expression ] inertial

target ::= name | aggregate

waveform ::= waveform_element { , waveform_element } | unaffected

Remove restrictions from unaffected in 8.4 (old) / 8.4.1(new)
Remove (Bottom p121 in 1076-2002)
It is an error if the reserved word unaffected appears as a waveform in a (sequential) signal assignment statement.

Notes:
1. The reserved word unaffected must only appear as a waveform in concurrent signal assignment statements (see 9.5.1).

Add (same place):
A simple signal assignment of the form

```
target <= [delay_mechanism] unaffected ;
```

shall have the same effect as replacing the given assignment with a null statement (not a null assignment).

15 Add (same place):
   It is an error if the reserved word guarded appears as a waveform in the sequential form of the signal assignment statement.

Notes:
1. The reserved word guarded must only appear as a waveform in concurrent signal assignment statements (see 9.5).

**Move current clause 8.4.1 to 8.4.1.1 and change the BNF as shown below:**

8.4.1.1 Updating a projected output waveform

The effect of execution of a signal assignment statement is defined in terms of its effect upon the projected output waveforms (see 12.6.1) representing the current and future values of drivers of signals.

```
waveform_element ::= 
   logical [ after time_expression ] |
   null [ after time_expression ]
```

**8.4.1.1 Editing Notes**

Making a waveform_element a logical allows a conditional waveform (see next section) to be distinguished from a ternary expression. A ternary expression has parentheses, a conditional waveform does not.

**Add Clause 8.4.2 Conditional Signal Assignments (see editing notes that follow)**

8.4.2 Conditional signal assignments

The conditional signal assignment statement is a short hand notation that can be replaced by an if statement and a set of simple signal assignments.

```
conditional_signal_assignment ::= 
   target <= options conditional_waveforms ;
```

```
conditional_waveforms ::= 
```

6
waveform when condition
{ else waveform when condition } [ else waveform ]

The options for a conditional signal assignment statement are discussed in 8.4.1.

Conditional signal assignment is defined in terms of the following transformation. If the conditional signal assignment is of the form

```
target <= options
  waveform1 when condition1 else
  waveform2 when condition2 else
  ...
  waveformN-1 when conditionN-1 else
  waveformN when conditionN;
```

then the equivalent if statement and simple signal assignments are of the form

```
if condition1 then
  target <= options waveform1;  -- simple signal assignment
elsif condition2 then
  target <= options waveform2 ;
  ...
elsif conditionN-1 then
  target <= options waveformN-1;
elsif conditionN then
  target <= options waveformN ;
end if;
```

If a label appears on the conditional signal assignment, then the same label appears on the corresponding if statement. If the delay mechanism option appears in the conditional signal assignment, then the same delay mechanism appears in every simple signal assignment statement of the transformed assignment.

The characteristics of the waveforms and conditions in the conditional assignment statement must be such that the if statement in the transformed code is a legal statement.

Example:

```
S <= unaffected when Input_pin = S'DrivingValue else
  Input_pin after Buffer_Delay;
```

NOTE—The wave transform of a waveform of the form unaffected is the null statement, not the null transaction.
Editing notes for 8.4.2
Do we need something explaining how the lack of a final else implies an assignment to unaffected? This would mean changing the transformation to show to end in else.

The text on waveform transforms was removed because the equivalent assignment is a simple signal assignment and is already defined in this section so no further transformations are required.

Unaffected was removed since its transformation is now explained in simple signal assignment.

Add Clause 8.4.3 Selected Signal Assignments (see editing notes that follow)

8.4.3 Selected signal assignments
The selected signal assignment statement is a short hand notation that can be replaced by a case statement and a set of simple signal assignments.

```
selected_signal_assignment ::= 
  with expression select 
  target <= options selected_waveforms ;

selected_waveforms ::= 
  { waveform when choices , } 
  waveform when choices
```

The options for a selected signal assignment statement are discussed in 8.4.1.

Selected signal assignment is defined in terms of the following transformation. If the selected signal assignment is of the form

```
with expression select 
  target <= options waveform1 when choice_list1 , 
  waveform2 when choice_list2 , 
  .
  .
  .
  waveformN-1 when choice_listN-1, 
  waveformN when choice_listN ;
```

then the equivalent case statement and simple signal assignments are of the form

```
case expression is 
  when choice_list1 =>
    target <= options waveform1 ;  -- simple signal assignment
  when choice_list2 =>
    target <= options waveform2 ;
  .
```


•

when choice_listN-1 =>
  target <= options waveformN-1 ;
when choice_listN =>
  target <= options waveformN ;
end case ;

If a label appears on the selected signal assignment, then the same label appears on the corresponding case statement. If the delay mechanism option appears in the selected signal assignment, then the same delay mechanism appears in every simple signal assignment statement of the transformed assignment.

The characteristics of the select expression, the waveforms, and the choices in the selected assignment statement must be such that the case statement in the transformed code is a legal statement.

Change Clause 8.5 to:
8.5 Variable assignment statement
A variable assignment statement replaces the current value of a variable with a new value specified by an expression. The named variable and the right-hand side expression must be of the same type.

variable_assignment_statement ::= 
  [label :] simple_variable_assignment
  | [label :] selected_variable_assignment

Move rest of clause 8.5 to 8.5.1 and change the term variable assignment to simple variable assignment.
8.5.1 Simple variable assignment statement

Simple_variable_assignment ::= 
  [ label : ] target := expression ;

Move clause 8.5.1 to 8.5.1.1

Add section 8.5.2
The selected variable assignment statement is a short hand notation that can be replaced by a case statement and a set of simple variable assignments.

selected_variable_assignment ::= 
  with expression select
  target <= options selected_expression ;

selected_expression ::= 
  { expression when choices , } 
  expression when choices
Selected variable assignment is defined in terms of the following transformation. If the selected variable assignment is of the form

```vbc
with expression select
  target := waveform1 when choice_list1,
  waveform2 when choice_list2,
  •
  •
  waveformN-1 when choice_listN-1,
  waveformN when choice_listN;
```

then the equivalent case statement and simple variable assignments are of the form

```vbc
case expression is
  when choice_list1 =>
    target := expression1; -- simple variable assignment

  when choice_list2 =>
    target := expression2;
    •
    •

  when choice_listN-1 =>
    target := expressionN-1;

  when choice_listN =>
    target := expressionN;

end case;
```

If a label appears on the selected variable assignment, then the same label appears on the corresponding case statement.

The characteristics of the select expression, the waveforms, and the choices in the selected assignment statement must be such that the case statement in the transformed code is a legal statement.

**Changes to Clause 9.5:**

9.5 Concurrent signal assignment statements

The concurrent signal assignment statement is a short hand notation for an equivalent process statement with the corresponding sequential form of the signal assignment statement.

```vbc
Concurrent_signal_assignment_statement ::= [label : ] [ postponed ] simple_signal_assignment |
                                      [label : ] [ postponed ] conditional_signal_assignment |
                                      [label : ] [ postponed ] selected_signal_assignment
```
Each concurrent signal assignment has an identically formatted sequential signal assignment. The concurrent forms will be defined by a transformation to an equivalent process that uses the corresponding sequential signal assignment.

The primary difference in syntax between the concurrent and sequential forms of signal assignment is the support of the guarded option. The option guarded specifies that the signal assignment statement is executed when a signal GUARD changes from FALSE to TRUE, or when that signal has been TRUE and an event occurs on one of the signal assignment statement’s inputs. (The signal GUARD must be either one of the implicitly declared GUARD signals associated with block statements that have guard expressions, or it must be an explicitly declared signal of type Boolean that is visible at the point of the concurrent signal assignment statement.) The delay mechanism option specifies the pulse rejection characteristics of the signal assignment statement (see 8.4.1).

If the target of a concurrent signal assignment is a name that denotes a guarded signal (see 4.3.1.2), or if it is in the form of an aggregate and the expression in each element association of the aggregate is a static signal name denoting a guarded signal, then the target is said to be a guarded target. If the target of a concurrent signal assignment is a name that denotes a signal that is not a guarded signal, or if it is in the form of an aggregate and the expression in each element association of the aggregate is a static signal name denoting a signal that is not a guarded signal, then the target is said to be an unguarded target. It is an error if the target of a concurrent signal assignment is neither a guarded target nor an unguarded target.

For any concurrent signal assignment statement, there is an equivalent process statement with the same meaning. The process statement equivalent to a concurrent signal assignment statement whose target is a signal name is constructed as follows:

a) If a label appears on the concurrent signal assignment statement, then the same label appears on the process statement.

b) The equivalent process statement is a postponed process if and only if the concurrent signal assignment statement includes the reserved word postponed.

c) If the delay mechanism option appears in the concurrent signal assignment, then the same delay mechanism appears on the corresponding sequential signal assignment statement in the process statement.

d) The statement part of the equivalent process statement consists of a statement transform [described in item e)].

e) If the option guarded appears in the concurrent signal assignment statement, then the concurrent signal assignment is called a guarded assignment. If the concurrent signal assignment statement is a guarded assignment, and if the target of the concurrent signal assignment is a guarded target, then the statement transform is as follows:

```plaintext
if GUARD then
  signal_transform
```
else
   disconnection_statements
end if;

Otherwise, if the concurrent signal assignment statement is a guarded assignment, but if the
target of the concurrent signal assignment is not a guarded target, then the statement
transform is as follows:

   if GUARD then
   signal_transform
   end if;

Finally, if the concurrent signal assignment statement is not a guarded assignment, and if the
target of the concurrent signal assignment is not a guarded target, then the statement
transform is as follows:

   signal_transform

It is an error if a concurrent signal assignment is not a guarded assignment and the target of
the concurrent signal assignment is a guarded target.

A signal transform is the replacement of the concurrent signal assignment statement with its
corresponding sequential signal assignment statement.

f) If the concurrent signal assignment statement is a guarded assignment, or if any expression
(other than a time expression) within the concurrent signal assignment statement references a
signal, then the process statement contains a final wait statement with an explicit sensitivity
clause. The sensitivity clause is constructed by taking the union of the sets constructed by
applying the rule of 8.1 to each of the aforementioned expressions. Furthermore, if the
concurrent signal assignment statement is a guarded assignment, then the sensitivity clause
also contains the simple name GUARD. (The signals identified by these names are called the
inputs of the signal assignment statement.) Otherwise, the process statement contains a final
wait statement that has no explicit sensitivity clause, condition clause, or timeout clause.

Under certain conditions (see above) the equivalent process statement may contain a sequence of
disconnection statements. A disconnection statement is a sequential signal assignment
statement that assigns a null transaction to its target. If a sequence of disconnection statements is
present in the equivalent process statement, the sequence consists of one sequential signal
assignment for each scalar subelement of the target of the concurrent signal assignment
statement. For each such sequential signal assignment, the target of the assignment is the
corresponding scalar subelement of the target of the concurrent signal assignment, and the
waveform of the assignment is a null waveform element whose time expression is given by the
applicable disconnection specification (see 5.3).

If the target of a concurrent signal assignment statement is in the form of an aggregate, then the
same transformation applies. Such a target must contain only locally static signal names;
moreover, it is an error if any signal is identified by more than one signal name. It is an error if a
null waveform element appears in a waveform of a concurrent signal assignment statement. Execution of a concurrent signal assignment statement is equivalent to execution of the equivalent process statement.

5 NOTES
1—A concurrent signal assignment statement whose waveforms and target contain only static expressions is equivalent to a process statement whose final wait statement has no explicit sensitivity clause, so it will execute once through at the beginning of simulation and then suspend permanently.

2—A concurrent signal assignment statement whose waveforms are all the reserved word unaffected has no drivers for the target, since every waveform in the concurrent signal assignment statement is transformed to the statement

```
null;
```

in the equivalent process statement (see 8.4.2).

15 Remove Clause 9.5.1 and 9.5.2
Most of the content was incorporated into the new clauses 8.4.2 and 8.4.3